

OSGOODE HALL LAW SCHOOL

**CONFLICT OF LAWS
2004**

CASES AND MATERIALS

Professor Janet Walker

CONFLICT OF LAWS 2004

CASES AND MATERIALS

Professor Janet Walker

Introduction

Beals v Saldanha	1
Constitution Act/Courts of Justice Act	3

PART I – JURISDICTION

1. The Scope of Jurisdiction

(a) State Immunity/Consular Immunity

The State Immunity Act	5
Schreiber v Federal Republic of Germany	9
Bouzari v Iran	15

(b) Matters Subject to Treaty

Carriage by Air Act, ss 28, 29	24
Marine Liability Act, s 45	24
Gal v Northern Mountain Helicopters Inc	24
International Commercial Arbitration Act	28
Kaverit Steel and Crane v Kone Corp	35

(c) Exclusive Jurisdiction

Duke v Andler	42
Brussels Regulation - Articles 22, 25	46
Voyage Co Industries v Craster	46
Compensation (Prohibition of Foreign Legal Proceedings) Act 1995 (PPNG)	49
Quebec Civil Code, Arts 3129, 3151	50

2. The Bases of Jurisdiction

(a) Consent

(i) Agreement

Fairfield v Low	51
“The Canmar Fortune”	56
Rudder v Microsoft Corp	63
Underwriters at Lloyds’ Mauran	68
Brussels Regulation - Article 23	69

(ii) Attornment

Roglass Consultants v Kennedy	70
-------------------------------------	----

Dovenmuehle v Rocca Group	71
Parsons v McDonald's Restaurants of Canada Ltd.....	73
Brussels Regulation - Articles 24-26	78

(b) Defendant's Home Court

(i) Individuals

Maharane of Baroda v Wildenstein.....	79
Burhnam v Superior Court	82

(ii) Corporations

Extra-provincial Corporations Act.....	87
Adams v Cape Industries plc.....	88
ILA Committee on International Civil and Commercial Litigation Resolution	89

(iii) Assets

SDI Simulation Group Inc. v Chameleon Technologies Inc.....	90
Tortel Communications Inc. v Suntel, Inc.	93

(iii) Domicile/Residence

Brussels Regulation - Articles 2-4	95
--	----

(c) Real and Substantial Connection

Rule 17 — Service Outside Ontario.....	96
Moran v Pyle National (Canada) Ltd.	98
Uniform Court Jurisdiction and Proceedings Transfer Act: Part 2.....	101
Brussels Regulation - Articles 5-21	104
Québec Civil Code: Book Ten	108
Spar Aerospace Ltd v American Mobile Satellite Corp.....	110

(d) Order and Fairness

Muscutt v Courcelles.....	124
---------------------------	-----

3. Determining Appropriate Forum

(a) The Doctrine of Forum Non Conveniens

Airbus Industrie GIE v Patel (HL)	143
Amchem Products Inc. v British Columbia (Workers' Compensation Board).....	144
Spiliada Maritime Corp. v Cansulex Ltd.	161
Societe Nationale Industrielle Aerospatiale v Lee Kui Juk	173

(b) The Burden of Proof in Stays

Frymer v Brettschneider.....	182
------------------------------	-----

(c) Personal or Juridical Advantage

Jaffe v Dearing	188
Connelley v RTZ Corporation plc.....	191
Lubbe v Cape plc.....	196
Oakley v Barry	204

(d) Jurisdiction Agreements and Injunctions

The “Angelic Grace”	209
---------------------------	-----

(e) The Injunction Test Revisited

Airbus Industrie GIE v Patel (HL)	217
Hudon v Geos Language Corporation.....	227
Turner v Grovit.....	229

(f) Single Forum Cases/Negative Declarations

Midland Bank plc v Laker Airways Ltd.....	235
---	-----

(g) Multiplicity

Brussels Convention - Articles 27-30	238
Canadian National Railway Co v Sydney Steel Corp.	239
472900 BC Ltd v Thrifty Canada.	242
Westec Aerospace Inc v Raytheon Aircraft Co.	249
Leuven/London Principles	258

(h) Transfer of Proceedings

28 United States Code Service §§1404, 1406.....	261
Jurisdiction of Courts (Cross-vesting) Act, 1987 (Australia)	261
Bankinvest AG v Seabrook	272
Uniform Court Jurisdiction and Proceedings Transfer Act: Part 3	271

(i) Interim Relief

Brussels Convention - Article 31	275
Aetna Financial Services Limited v Feigelman	275
Republic of Haiti v Duvalier	278
United States of America v Friedland	284
United States of America v Yemec	285

PART II - JUDGMENTS

1. The Conclusiveness of Foreign Judgments

Godard v Gray	291
---------------------	-----

2. The Requirements for Recognition and Enforcement

(a) *Prima Facie* Enforceability

(i) Jurisdiction of the Issuing Court

Schibsby v Westenholz	296
Constitution of the United States of America, Article IV, Amendments V, XIV.....	299
International Shoe Co v State of Washington	299
Morguard Investments Ltd. v De Savoye	303
Braintech, Inc v Kostiuk	316

(ii) Characteristics of an Enforceable Judgment

Four Embarcadero Center Venture v Mr. Greenjeans Corp.	321
Uniforêt Pate Port-Cartier v Zerotech Technologies Inc.	324
Silverstar Properties Ltd. v Veinotte.....	329
Beatty v Beatty	338

(b) Foreign public law exception

United States of America v Ivey	339
Cuban Liberty and Democratic Solidarity (Libertad) Act of 1996	350
Foreign Extraterritorial Measures Act	351

(c) Impeachment

(i) Fraud

Beals v Saldanha <i>per</i> Major J	355
---	-----

(ii) Natural Justice

Beals v Saldanha <i>per</i> Binnie J.....	367
---	-----

(iii) Public Policy

Lloyd's v Saunders.....	375
Kidron v Grean.....	397

(iv) Prior Inconsistent Local Judgment

Vervaeke (Formerly Messina) v Smith	401
---	-----

3. Codifications, Federal and Regional Systems

Québec Civil Code: Book Ten	406
Brussels Regulation - Preamble, Articles 1, 32-56	407
Uniform Enforcement of Foreign Judgments Act.....	413

PART III – CHOICE OF LAW-GENERAL PRINCIPLES

1. Choice of Law Methodology

Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust plc (No 3)	417
Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One—General Provisions	418
Babcock v Jackson	419
Bernhard v Harrah’s Club	422
Breavington v Godleman.....	428
Stevens v Head	430
Hunt v T&N plc.....	432

2. Proof of Foreign Law

Amosin v Mercury Bell	438
Bumper Development Corp. Ltd. v Commissioner of Police of the Metropolis	443
Etler v Kertesz	448
Petkus v Becker	449
Old North State Brewing Co v Newlands Services Inc.....	449

3. Characterization/The Incidental Question

Kingsway General Insurance Co v Canada Life Assurance Co	457
Agnew v Gober	460
Schwebel v Ungar	461

4. Domicile

Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title Two, Chapter I – Personal Status	462
Winans v Attorney General	464
Re Annesley	467
Osthvath-Latcoczy v Osthvath-Latcoczy	470
Patterson v Patterson.....	471
White v Tennant.....	473

5. Renvoi and the Time Element

Re Annesley	478
Re Ross	479
Ross v Ross	482
Granot v Hersen	484
Starkowski v AG	491

6. Substance and Procedure

(a) The Basic Rule

Tolofson v Jensen	494
Phrantzes v Argenti	497

(b) Examples

(i) Parties

Hal Commodities Cycles Management v Kirsh 501

(ii) Evidence

In re Cohn 503

(iii) Remedies/Costs

Somers v Fournier 505

(c) Harmonization of the Law of Procedure

American Law Institute, Transnational Rules of Civil Procedure 515

7. Foreign Public Law

Laane v Estonian Cargo and Passenger Steamship Line..... 519
AG (UK) v Heinemann Publishers Australia Pty Ltd 522
Kuwait Airways Corporation v Iraqi Airways 528

8. Public Policy

Vladi v Vladi 540

PART IV – CHOICE OF LAW: AREAS OF LAW

1. Torts

Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title Two, Articles 3126-3128 545
Tolofson v Jensen; Lucas v Gagnon 546
Johnson v Coventry Churchill International Ltd..... 562
Hanlan v Sernesky 567
Wong v Wei 568
Wong v Lee 574
PIL (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1995 Part III - Choice of Law in Tort and Delict . 584
Shevill v Presse Alliance SA..... 586

2. Contracts

(a) Determining the Proper Law

Star Texas 590
Imperial Life Assurance Co. of Canada v Colmenares 594
Amin Rasheed Shipping Corporation v Kuwait Insurance Co 596
Quebec Civil Code, Articles 311-313 599
The Rome Convention- Articles 1-4, 10, 12-15, 17-19 600

(b) Applying the Proper Law

(i) Capacity

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3083-3087 603
The Rome Convention- Article 11 603
Bondholders Securities Corp v Manville 604

(ii) Validity

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3109-3110 606
The Rome Convention- Article 8 606
Etlér v Kertész 607

(iii) Special Kinds of Contracts

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3114-3120 613
The Rome Convention- Articles 5-7, 16 614

(iv) Harmonization of the Law of International Sales Contracts

International Sale of Goods Act 616

3. Property

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3097 617

(a) Immovables

Godley v Coles 618
Landry v Lachapelle 620

(b) Movables

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3102-3106 622
Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust plc (No 3) 623
Personal Property Security Act (ss. 5-8) 632
Re Adair 633

4. Succession

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3098-3101, 3107-3108 636

(a) Administration

Estates Administration Act 637
Estates Act 637
Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure 638

(b) Succession

Succession Law Reform Act 638

Re Vak Estate	640
Allison v Allison	643

5. Family Law

(a) Formal Validity of Marriages

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3088-3089	645
Berthiaume v Dastous	645
McCabe v McCabe.....	648

(b) Essential Validity of Marriages

Frew (otherwise Reed) v Reed.....	650
Marriage Act	652
Marriage (Prohibited Degrees) Act.....	654
Feiner v Demkowicz (falsely called Feiner)	654
Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) v Narwal	657

(c) Divorce and Ancillary Relief

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3090-3096, 3122-3124.....	660
Divorce Act, ss 3-6, 22-23	661
Family Law Act, ss 1, 15, 58	662